	Evidence Sheet: Child prOtection Bruises aspEcts Study (COBS update 2013) Critical appraisal form for case series and case studies; case-control, cross-sectional, uncontrolled before & after,									
prospective cohort / longitudinal, retrospective cohort study, (interrupted time series) Reviewers name: Date:										
Citation including IDENTIFIER (number):										
	. ,									
Se	ection A.									
_	Study Type: please tick study type		Study Type: please tick study type							
01	case-control	O ₃	prospective cohort/ longitudinal							
O ₂	cross-sectional	O ₄	retrospective cohort study							
O_2	interrupted time series uncontrolled before and after study	O ₅	case-series case study							
0	-	106	oddo olddy	I						
	ection B.	/A)/ Alla	actiona, (include studies of	f . 10 vooro			Vac			
	this study address either of the following I Can you age bruises in live children?	key que	estions: (include studies of	i < 18 years)			Yes			
	Are there diagnostic or suggestive pattern	s of bri	ising in abused children	12						
	Include:-	3 01 010	alsing in abuseu ciliuren							
	Comparative papers that describe a	abusive	e/accidental bruising							
	Abusive bruising patterns only		•							
	 Accidental bruising patterns only 									
Exclus	sion Criteria (please tick any of the following	criteria	which apply)							
XOIU	Does not address key questions	ontone	т мпон арргу)				гі			
	Formal consensus / expert opinion / person	al pract	ice / review article				L J			
	Rank of abuse is 4 OR 5 OR mixed ran	•		he extracted	nor na	rt of	L J			
	original exclusion criteria (Q2 Only)	ix, wilci	c relevant eases cannot	be extracted	noi po		LJ			
	Adult only data OR mixed adult & child data	, where	child data cannot be isola	ited			[]			
	Methodologically flawed papers	,					ίi			
94	oction C									
	Section C. Additional Study Quality Criteria Required									
1. How have the authors defined abuse? (Please state criteria used)										
		ase stat	e criteria used)							
		ase stat	,							
1.	How have the authors defined abuse? (Plea		Rank 1							
			Rank 1 Rank 2							
1.	How have the authors defined abuse? (Please ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH CORRECTION OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PR	Q2 –	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3				-			
1.	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH CABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you ap	12 – oply?	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4							
1. 2. Rank	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you ap 1: Abuse confirmed at case conference, family)2 – pply? y, civil	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5	e specify						
1. 2. Rank or crim	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applicately appl)2 – pply? y, civil	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4							
1. 2. Rank or crimindeperindeperindeperindeperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindenteperindentep	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applicately a court proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and ently witnessed or described by victim	pply? y, civil	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please	udy does not						
2. Rank or crimindeper Rank includi	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied to the confirmed at case conference, family and court proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and ently witnessed or described by victim 2: Abuse confirmed by stated/ referenced criticing multi-disciplinary assessment	pply? y, civil	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if storelate to Q", abuse of	udy does not cases)						
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applicate the country of	oply? y, civil cor, eria	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if sterelate to Q", abuse of	udy does not cases) or 5 ranking,	or is m					
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied to the country proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by stated or described by victim and court proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by stated or described by victim and an admitted by stated or described by victim and multi-disciplinary assessment as a stated by stated criteria as a stated but no supporting detail given	oply? y, civil cor, eria	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if strelate to Q", abuse collected to Q",	udy does not cases) or 5 ranking, but the relev	or is mant hig	gher rar	nked			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Rank	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied to a court proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by stated or described by victim and account proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and account proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and account proceedings, admitted by victim account proceedings accoun	oply? y, civil cor, eria	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if strelate to Q", abuse collected 4/5 and another, cases cannot be extra	udy does not cases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou	or is m ant hiç ıld be	gher rar EXCLU	nked DED			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Rank	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied to the country proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by stated or described by victim and court proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by stated or described by victim and an admitted by stated or described by victim and multi-disciplinary assessment as a stated by stated criteria as a stated but no supporting detail given	oply? y, civil cor, eria	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if strelate to Q", abuse collected to Q",	udy does not cases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou	or is m ant hiç ıld be	gher rar EXCLU	nked DED			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Rank Mixed	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied to a court proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by stated or described by victim and the confirmed by victim and	nply? y, civil cor, eria	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if storelate to Q", abuse of the color of the col	udy does not eases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be	gher rar EXCLU	nked DED			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Mixed	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied to the confirmed at case conference, family and court proceedings, admitted by perpetrated and the confirmed by stated by victim 2: Abuse confirmed by stated/referenced critical multi-disciplinary assessment 3: Abuse defined by stated criteria 4: Abuse stated but no supporting detail given 5: Suspected abuse 1 ranking	nply? y, civil cor, eria	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if storelate to Q", abuse of the color of the col	udy does not eases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be	gher rar EXCLU	nked DED			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Mixed	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied that ranking of abuse criteria would you applied to the court proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and entitly witnessed or described by victim and the confirmed by stated of referenced criticing multi-disciplinary assessment and the court proceedings are criteria at the court proceedings and the criteria at the court proceedings are criteria at the criteria at the court proceedings are criteria at the court proceedings are criteria at the criteria at the court proceedings are criteria at the	oply? y, civil cor, eria	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if storelate to Q", abuse of the color of the col	udy does not eases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be	gher rar EXCLU	nked DED			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Mixed	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you are also and the court proceedings, admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by perpetrate and an admitted by stated by victim and the confirmed by stated referenced criticing multi-disciplinary assessment and the court proceedings are also by stated and the criteria and the court proceedings and the criteria and the court proceedings and the criteria and the court proceedings and the criteria a	nply? y, civil or, eria NON-A	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if storelate to Q", abuse of the composite of the co	udy does not eases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be of criti	gher rai EXCLU ical app	nked DED oraisal			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Mixed	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you apply that ranking of abuse criteria dendently witnessed or described by victim apply that confirmed by stated referenced critical ranking apply that ranking the authors actively excluded abuse from any comparate cause) If your study does not contain any comparate data, (concerns NAI only) please tick has a supported abuse.	NON-A	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if strelate to Q", abuse of the company of the compan	udy does not eases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be of criti	gher rai EXCLU ical app	nked DED oraisal			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Mixed Have to organi	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied to the confirmed at case conference, family and court proceedings, admitted by perpetrated and the confirmed by stated by victim and court proceedings, admitted by perpetrated and the confirmed by stated criteria and the court and	pply? y, civil or, eria NON-A	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if sterelate to Q", abuse of the composition of scene Rank 1 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please If study has a level 4 of level 4/5 and another, cases cannot be extra (If study is excluded of form) ABUSED group? (accident N/A []	udy does not cases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be of criti	gher rai EXCLU ical app	nked DED oraisal			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Mixed Have to organi	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied that ranking of abuse criteria would you applied to the confirmed at case conference, family in a court proceedings, admitted by perpetrated and the confirmed by stated by victim and the confirmed by stated referenced criticing multi-disciplinary assessment and the confirmed by stated criteria and the confirmed by stated c	pply? y, civil cor, eria NON-A ative ere: forensic	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if strelate to Q", abuse of the composition of second / or diagnosis from clinic	udy does not cases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be of criti	gher rai EXCLU ical app	nked DED oraisal			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Rank Mixed Have to organi A ¹ . A ² . B ¹ .	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you apply that ranking of abuse criteria dendently witnessed or described by victim apply that confirmed by stated referenced critical ranking apply that ranking the authors actively excluded abuse from any comparate cause) Independently witnessed accidental cause or the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child proper that the authors actively excluded abuse from any comparate that are the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the authors actively excluded abuse from any comparate that are the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmation of organic disease (diagnostic by multi-disciplinary assessment and child property that the confirmatio	pply? y, civil cor, eria NON-A ative ere: forensic c test ar otection	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if strelate to Q", abuse of the composition of second of or diagnosis from clinical investigation	udy does not cases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be of criti	gher rai EXCLU ical app	nked DED oraisal			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Mixed Have to organi A ¹ . A ² . B ¹ . B ² .	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied that ranking of abuse criteria decently witnessed or described by victim applied that ranking assessment as a same applied to the ranking of the authors actively excluded abuse from any croause) If your study does not contain any comparate data, (concerns NAI only) please tick had a lindependently witnessed accidental cause or applied that ranking assessment and child proceed that the consistent account of accident by the same in the consistent account of accident by the same in the consistent account of accident by the same in the consistent account of accident by the same in the consistent account of accident by the same in the consistent account of accident accident accident.	pply? y, civil cor, eria NON-A ative ere: forensic t test ar otection	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if strelate to Q", abuse of the composition of scene and / or diagnosis from clinical investigation all over time	udy does not cases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be of criti	gher rai EXCLU ical app	nked DED oraisal			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Mixed Have forgani A ¹ . A ² . B ¹ . B ³ .	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied that ranking of abuse criteria dendently witnessed or described by victim applied to the criteria dendently witnessed or described by victim applied to the criteria dendently witnessed with the criteria dendently witnessed active abuse of the authors actively excluded abuse from any comparation of active a	pply? y, civil cor, eria NON-A ative ere: forensic c test ar otection ndividua records	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if strelate to Q", abuse of the composition of second of the composition	udy does not cases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be of criti	gher rai EXCLU ical app	nked DED oraisal			
Rank or crimindeper Rank includir Rank Rank Mixed Have to organi A ¹ . A ² . B ¹ . B ² . C ¹ .	ONLY RELATES TO COBS RESEARCH OF ABUSE CASES What ranking of abuse criteria would you applied that ranking of abuse criteria decently witnessed or described by victim applied that ranking assessment as a same applied to the ranking of the authors actively excluded abuse from any croause) If your study does not contain any comparate data, (concerns NAI only) please tick had a lindependently witnessed accidental cause or applied that ranking assessment and child proceed that the consistent account of accident by the same in the consistent account of accident by the same in the consistent account of accident by the same in the consistent account of accident by the same in the consistent account of accident by the same in the consistent account of accident accident accident.	pply? y, civil cor, eria NON-A ative ere: forensic c test ar otection adividua records ut no de	Rank 1 Rank 2 Rank 3 Rank 4 Rank 5 Mixed ranks – please Not applicable (if strelate to Q", abuse of the composition of second of the composition	udy does not cases) or 5 ranking, but the relev acted), it shou go to the end	or is m ant hiç ıld be of criti	gher rai EXCLU ical app	nked DED oraisal			

Section D.

Methodological Quality Criteria. ¹	Yes	No	Unclear	N/A or I do not
Please tick the appropriate column.				know
Were the aims of the study clearly stated?				
2. Was the study clearly focused in terms of population selected, the comparative features assessed (where appropriate ie comparative studies) and outcomes considered?				
3. Do the authors appear to have conducted a preparatory unbiased literature review to identify current state of knowledge?				
4. Was the choice of study method appropriate?				
5. Are the inclusion criteria explicit?				
6. Have the results of the study been clearly presented?				
7. Are the data in the tables or graphs and the text consistent?				
8. Were all important outcomes/ results considered?				
for Comparative Studies only (eg cross sectional, case control)				
9. Was study size considered and is it likely to have affected the results?				
10. Was the ascertainment clearly stated?				
11. Was the comparison group appropriately chosen?				
12. Was the comparison group enrolled in the same time period and assessed in the same way as the abused group?				
13. Were the statistical methods used appropriately?				

¹ Adapted from the following sources:

Critical Appraisal Skills Programme: http://www.phru.nhs.uk/Pages/PHD/CASP.htm
Undertaking systematic reviews of research on effectiveness. University of York: NHS Centre for Reviews & Dissemination , 2001;
Polgar A, Thomas SA. Chapter 22. Critical evaluation of published research in Introduction to research in the health sciences. 3rd edition. Melbourne: Churchill Livingstone,

Weightman AL, Mann MK, Sander L and Turley RL Health Evidence Bulletins Wales, A systematic approach to identifying the evidence, Project Methodology 5. Cardiff: Information Services UWCM, January 2004

Rychetnik L, Frommer M A schema for evaluating evidence on public health interventions version 4, National Public Health Partnership, Melbourne 2002

Section E.				
Reviewer's Conclusion and Comments				_
Key points meriting inclusion (list strengths)				
Weaknesses, potential confounders and study limitations				
Section F.				
Final Decision	Yes	No	Comment	
Is the study included?				
If you have suggested contacting the authors for further				
information (e.g. regarding confirmation of abuse) please	e			
select INCLUDE if you feel the study meets all other				
requisite inclusion criteria				
If the study is excluded, should it be kept for background				
information, introduction or discussion?				
	<u> </u>			
Section G.				
Additional comments (e.g. write to authors)				
- Additional commonic (eig. Who to damero)				